

---

**From:** Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <garwin.yip@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 8, 2019 12:58 PM  
**To:** Sarah Gallagher; Brittany Cunningham - NOAA Affiliate  
**Cc:** Naseem Alston; Cathy Marcinkevage; Howard Brown; Susan Boring  
**Subject:** ROC on LTO: Clear Creek comments

Sarah,

We received comments back from Rosalie on the Clear Creek effects section, which I placed in the ROCON drive.

-- Please incorporate Rosalie's comments from her "2.5 and 2.6 Trinity-Clear Creek Effects--to reviewers.rd" file into your master file. The easiest way, I think, is to change change the track changes user name to Rosalie to type in all of her comments and edits (there weren't that many), then change it back to you.

-- Please address all outstanding comments, and Rosalie's track changes, so in the end, we will have a clean document with only comment bubbles for references.

-- For those comments you need help with to address, you can write a comment reply indicating that, then ask whoever may be able to help you as you go, rather than save them until the end.

-- Note that I will be sending out task e-mails individually, and you may have overlapping tasks. If you need help with workload or priorities, Howard, Cathy, and/or I will be available to help.

-- Note that Rosalie would like to see a revised version before she clears this section, so please let me know when you are finished so I can send it back to her.

-- Finally, Rosalie will be on leave part of next week, so it would be great if we could send a revised version back to her ASAP for another review and (hopefully) clearance. I'd like the revised draft by 12 p.m. tomorrow, and if you can't meet that, an early heads up.

Thanks.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*  
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



----- Forwarded message -----

From: Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)>

Date: Wed, May 8, 2019 at 12:18 PM

Subject: Re: E-mail 2: ROC on LTO draft BiOp sections for QA/QC review

To: Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)>

Cc: Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <[maria.rea@noaa.gov](mailto:maria.rea@noaa.gov)>, Christopher Keifer <[Christopher.Keifer@noaa.gov](mailto:Christopher.Keifer@noaa.gov)>, Howard Brown <[Howard.Brown@noaa.gov](mailto:Howard.Brown@noaa.gov)>, Cathy Marcinkevage <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)>, Susan Boring <[susan\\_boring@fws.gov](mailto:susan_boring@fws.gov)>

Hi Garwin and Team,

To close out my review of documents provided in Email #2, attached are comments on the Clear Creek section. I'd like to see this section again before clearing to look at the effects tables for species and critical habitat.

Thanks,  
Rosalie

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 9:56 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Garwin and Team,

I offer comments on the following sections that were transmitted in Email #2, and assuming my comments are addressed please consider the following sections cleared:

- Environmental Baseline
- Stressor introductions
- American River Division
- East Side Division

I still need to review Clear Creek and as you noted, I recently provided comments on the Shasta Division.

Thanks and please let me know if you have any questions.  
Rosalie

On Mon, May 6, 2019 at 9:46 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

All,

Attached are clean versions of the yellow-highlighted sections, except for the upper Sac/Shasta Division, which Rosalie just reviewed. Next to the bolded section "titles" are the drafters and reviewers of the sections. "(C)" means cleared.

## **1 Introduction:**

**1.1 Background** [Garwin (C) drafted; Barb reviewed]

**1.2 COA** [Garwin (C) drafted; Barb reviewed]

**1.3 Key consultation considerations** [Garwin (C) drafted; Barb, Cathy, Howard reviewed]

**1.4 Consultation history** [Brittany drafted based on initiation memo; Garwin reviewed]

**1.5 Proposed Federal Action** [Evan drafted; Howard, Amanda, Barb, Naseem, Garwin (C) reviewed]

**2.1 Analytical approach** [Evan and Cathy drafted; Howard, Naseem (C), Rosalie (C), Chris (C), Maria, Garwin (C) reviewed]

**2.2 Status of the species and CH** [Brittany and Page drafted; Barb, Amanda, Chris (C), Naseem, Garwin reviewed (C)]

**2.3 Action Area** [Evan drafted; Barb, Naseem (C), Rosalie (C), Garwin (C) reviewed]

**2.4 Environmental Baseline** [Brian drafted; Page, Naseem (C), Brian, Rosalie, Chris, Garwin (C) reviewed]

**2.5 & 2.6 Effects of the Action on species and CH**

**Stressor introductions** [Evan, Stephen, Kate drafted]

**American River Division** [Brian drafted; Brittany revised, Garwin reviewed x 2]

**Clear Creek** [Sarah drafted; Brittany revised, Garwin reviewed x 3]

**Shasta Division** [Evan drafted; Cathy revised x 3, Garwin reviewed x 3, Maria & Rosalie reviewed]

**East Side Division** [Barb drafted; Kristin revised, Garwin reviewed x 2]

**Delta Division** [Jeff drafted; Barb revised, Maria reviewed, Garwin reviewed x 2]

**SRKW** [Dan drafted; Jeff and Barb reviewed]

Chinook salmon analysis [John Hannon drafted; Dan, Jeff, Barb reviewed]

**Climate change** [Cathy drafted; Garwin reviewed]

**Benefits of ongoing restoration to include in multiple sections** [Naseem drafted; Garwin (C) reviewed]

**2.5.9 Life cycle model results** [Cathy drafted; Evan revised]

**2.7 Cumulative effects** [Brittany drafted, Garwin (C) reviewed]

## **2.8: Integration and Synthesis**

Winter-run Chinook salmon

CV spring-run Chinook salmon

CCV steelhead

sDPS green sturgeon

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611

Cell: 916-716-6558

FAX: 916-930-3629

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Mon, May 6, 2019 at 4:20 PM Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <[maria.rea@noaa.gov](mailto:maria.rea@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Thanks, Garwin. I'll wait to see your batched emails and download them on my lap top for quality plane time on Wednesday! I'll also spend a few hours on Thursday. As you know, Friday is booked with Barry meetings. My review may go over the weekend as well; to be realistic. I would like to see (if possible) a track changes version of Shasta and Delta with my comments embedded and the responses. In the past its also been really helpful to me to see Rosalie's comments, for example on the I and S sections.

Can you confirm all of these sections already have your and Naseem's review and clearance?

Thank you for all your hard work on this.

- M

Sent from my iPad

> On May 6, 2019, at 4:31 PM, Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

>

> All,

>

> Today (through this Friday, May 10) marks the initiation of the first QA/QC  
> review of the ROC on LTO draft BiOp. Rather than send the draft BiOp in a  
> single file (which is too big to do anyway), I am sending in separate files  
> for easier management. Below are the sections that I expect to send to you  
> before I call it a day today. Attached are the sections highlighted in  
> yellow.

>

> Please provide comments in track changes. All of the sections coming to you  
> will be clean. If you have reviewed an earlier draft, and want to see those  
> comments (or how we addressed them), let me know, and I/we will try to  
> accommodate.

>

>

> -Garwin-

> \* \_\_\_\_\_ \*

> \*Garwin Yip\*

> Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

> NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

> U.S. Department of Commerce

> California Central Valley Office

> 650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

> Sacramento, CA 95814

> Office: 916-930-3611

> Cell: 916-716-6558

> FAX: 916-930-3629

> [www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov) <<http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov>>

> <2-2-Status-of-Species-and-CH--to reviewers.docx>

> <1.1-1.5 Intro-for reviewers.docx>

> <2-3-Action-Area--to reviewers.docx>

> <2-1\_Analytical\_Approach--to reviewers.docx>

--  
Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.

*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

Office: (562) 980-4085

[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



**NOAA FISHERIES**  
West Coast Region

--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

